



MTO 15.2 Examples: Samarotto, Plays of Opposing Motion

(Note: audio, video, and other interactive examples are only available online)

<http://www.mtosmt.org/issues/mto.09.15.2/mto.09.15.2.samarotto.php>

Example 1. Examples from Schenker

a) *Free Composition*, Figure 124, 2a

Haydn, Symphony No. 104 in D Major, 2nd mvt., mm. 1-4

b) *Free Composition*, Figure 120, 6a and 6b

Haydn, "Emperor Hymn" (Qt. op. 76 no. 3)

c) Free Composition, Figure 40, 9

The musical score consists of a single staff with a treble clef. The melody is characterized by several ornaments: a mordent (marked with a caret ^) above the first note, a mordent above the fourth note, a mordent above the fifth note, a mordent above the sixth note, a mordent above the seventh note, and a mordent above the eighth note. The melody is divided into measures by vertical lines. A dashed line connects the fourth and fifth notes, and another dashed line connects the sixth and seventh notes. A bracket labeled "(3-prg.)" spans the sixth, seventh, and eighth notes. Below the staff, a harmonic analysis is provided, showing the sequence of chords: I (div.), IV (p.t.), II, V, and I. The analysis includes intervallic structures: (8 - - (8) - 8 - (8) - 8) for the first four chords, and (6/3 - 6/3 - 6/3) for the fifth chord. The word "(antiparallels)" is written above the first four chords. The analysis also includes a sharp sign and a 3/8 time signature symbol.

(8 - - (8) - 8 - (8) - 8) (antiparallels) (6/3 - 6/3 - 6/3) # 3/8

I (div.) — IV (p.t.) — II — V — I

d) Oster collection, File 10, 8r

Table: 11 18 27 28, 29 35 37 40 41

cresc.

p

quasi legg.

I (24)

Example 2. J. S. Bach, “Fugue in B Major” from *The Well-Tempered Clavier*, Book II

a) Opening

b) Schenker's analysis of the subject (MW I)

c) Closing

Musical score for measures 91-95. The score is in treble and bass clefs with a key signature of three sharps (F#, C#, G#). Measure 95 is marked with the number 95. The music features a complex texture with many beamed notes and chords.

Musical score for measures 96-100. The score is in treble and bass clefs with a key signature of three sharps (F#, C#, G#). The music features a complex texture with many beamed notes and chords.

Musical score for measures 101-105. The score is in treble and bass clefs with a key signature of three sharps (F#, C#, G#). Measure 101 is marked with the number 100. The music features a complex texture with many beamed notes and chords.

d) Author's sketch of the closing

93

(subject)

(=VI) IV V I⁶ (I⁶?) #II 7—6 V 5—6 3—4 #7 8—7 6—5 3 I

Example 3. J. S. Bach, "Fugue," BWV 903b

a) Opening

Fuga.

b) Schenker's analysis of the subject (MW I)

J.S. Bach, Chromatic Fantasy and Fugue

Fugue

c) Closing

154

158

This musical score consists of two systems of piano accompaniment. The first system, starting at measure 154, features a treble clef with a melodic line of eighth and sixteenth notes and a bass clef with a more rhythmic accompaniment. The second system, starting at measure 158, continues the piece with similar textures, ending with a final chord in the bass clef.

d) Author's sketch of the closing

154

5 * 4 3 2 1

I V $\frac{8}{4}$ = $\frac{7}{4}$ I II $\frac{6}{5}$ V $\frac{7}{4}$ I #

This sketch shows a melodic line in the treble clef and a bass line in the bass clef. The melodic line is marked with fingerings 5, 4, 3, 2, and 1. There are two asterisks (*) above the first and third measures of the sketch. Below the staff, Roman numerals indicate the harmonic structure: I, V, $\frac{8}{4}$, $\frac{7}{4}$, I, II, $\frac{6}{5}$, V, $\frac{7}{4}$, and I #.

Example 4. Haydn, *Symphony No. 104*, movement II, measures 1–37

Andante 5

Flauti

Oboi

Clarineti in $\begin{matrix} A \\ La \end{matrix}$

Fagotti

Corni in $\begin{matrix} G \\ Sol \end{matrix}$

Trombe in $\begin{matrix} D \\ Re \end{matrix}$

Timpani in $\begin{matrix} D A \\ Re La \end{matrix}$

Andante

Violino I

Violino II

Viola

Violoncello e Contrabasso

10 15

VI. I

VI. II

Vla.

Vlc.

Cb.

1. *p* *sf* *p*

Fg.

VI.I

VI.II

Vla.

Vlc. e Cb.

f *p* *pp* *f* *p* *f* *p*

Fg.

VI.I

VI.II

Vla.

Vlc. e Cb.

1. *p* *dim.*

Fg.

VI.I

VI.II

Vla.

Vlc. e Cb.

dim.

Example 5. Haydn, *Symphony No. 104*, movement II, measures 1–37, melodic and structural analyses

Thin beams indicate contra-structural melodic impulses.

3rd down compensation 3rd down 3rd down A missing A supplied compensation

^ 3 ^ 6 ? ? ^ 6 (conceptually dissonant with V)

Thick beams indicate the structural upper voice.

A B

I VI IV (V) V ⁷⁻⁶⁻⁵/₅₋₄₋₃ I D: VII⁷ I⁶ IV V ⁶⁻⁵/₄₋₃ I II IV II V

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 1–2: The third descent in the first two bars is a third progression prolonging tonic; the melodic ascent from B5 to E6 should not be taken as a fourth progression because VI occurs only as a passing chord between I and V. Note the systematic but quirky increase in the size of intervals from minor 2nd, to minor 3rd, perfect 4th, 5th, major 6th, minor 7th—surely conscious on Haydn’s part.
- Measures 9–16: Brief tonicizations of II and IV prolong V without displacing it; the emphases on C and E act indirectly as a seventh and a ninth above the dominant, without actually stating such a sonority.

$\hat{3}$ $\hat{6}$ $\hat{6}$ (temporarily supported by IV) $\hat{5}$ (melodically resolved to I)

3rd down compensation 3rd down 3rd down!

17

25

A'

$\hat{3}$ $\hat{3}$ IN $\hat{2}$ IN $\hat{2}$ $\hat{2}$ $\hat{1}$ codetta

I VI IV (V) V I⁶ IV⁵⁻ -6 6 V I

Example 6. Haydn, Op. 64, no. 5, movement iii, minuet only

Menuetto. Allegretto

5

10

15

20

25

Musical score for measures 25-30. The score is written for four staves: two treble clefs and two bass clefs. The key signature is one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 4/4. The music features a complex texture with multiple melodic lines and harmonic support. Measure 25 is marked with a fermata over the first two notes of the top staff.

30

35

p

Musical score for measures 30-35. The score is written for four staves: two treble clefs and two bass clefs. The key signature is one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 4/4. The music continues from the previous system. Measures 30 and 31 are marked with a fermata. Measures 32-35 are marked with a piano (*p*) dynamic. The texture remains complex with multiple melodic lines.

40

f

Musical score for measures 35-40. The score is written for four staves: two treble clefs and two bass clefs. The key signature is one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 4/4. The music continues from the previous system. Measures 36-37 are marked with a fermata. Measures 38-40 are marked with a forte (*f*) dynamic. The texture remains complex with multiple melodic lines.

Example 7. Haydn, Op. 64, no. 5, movement iii, minuet, sketch with contra-structural melodic impulses

The musical score is divided into two sections, A and B. Section A (measures 1-8) features a melodic line in the treble clef and a bass line in the bass clef. The melodic line starts with a descending third (3rd) in measures 1-2, followed by an ascending sixth (6th!) in measures 3-4, and ends with a descending second (2) in measure 8. The bass line is annotated with Roman numerals: I, #1 4/7, II 6-5, and V. Section B (measures 9-16) features a melodic line in the treble clef and a bass line in the bass clef. The melodic line starts with a descending fourth (4th) in measures 9-10, followed by a descending second (2) in measure 16. The bass line is annotated with Roman numerals: I, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8. The score includes fingerings (1-8) and articulation marks (NN).

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 1–2: A reading from $\hat{5}$ is possible but the choice of 3 maps better onto the downbeat-emphasized descending third in the first four bars, and sets off the melodic conflict more clearly.
- Measures 3–4: The inversion of the expected descending third E–C \sharp into an ascending sixth displaces the arrival D an octave higher, and motivates the following register transfer of both D and E.
- Measures 6–7: The unison texture is not merely the result of doubling but rather a rare instance of genuine parallel octaves between outer voices, employed for the rhetorical effect of hyperbole, exaggerating the upward motion.

A'

The image shows a musical score for measures 17 through 24. The score is written for piano, with a treble clef on the upper staff and a bass clef on the lower staff. The key signature has two sharps (F# and C#). Measure 17 is marked with a circled '17'. The piano part consists of chords and single notes. Fingerings are indicated by numbers 1 through 5. Chord symbols are written below the bass staff: I, VI 4, II 6, V 5, I, V, I. There are also some annotations above the treble staff, including a circled '3' and a '3' with an accent (^) above it, and a sequence of '3', '2', '1' with accents (^) above them. A dotted line connects the first '3' to the second '3'.

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 20–24: The ascending register transfer in measures 5–6 is initially rescinded here by the descending motions in the first violin, only to be reinstated in measures 39–40 as a last laugh (also a rhetorical effect!).

Coda

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 27–29: The foreshortening of the motive produces a hemiola, indicated in the sketch by special barlines.
- Measures 41–42: Compare to measures 21–22. (Really the last laugh?)

Example 8. Beethoven, *Piano Sonata Op. 7, movement iii, Trio only*

Minore.

5

9

13

18

22

mf

f

p

dim. cresc.

mf

ff

ff

26

Measures 26-29: The right hand plays a melodic line with eighth notes and quarter notes, while the left hand provides a steady accompaniment of eighth notes. Dynamics include *f* and *mf*. A first ending bracket is present at the end of measure 29.

30

Measures 30-34: The right hand continues the melodic line with eighth notes. Dynamics include *mp* and *mf*. The left hand accompaniment remains consistent.

35

Measures 35-39: The right hand features a melodic line with eighth notes. Dynamics include *mp* and *mf*. The left hand accompaniment continues.

40

Measures 40-43: The right hand plays a melodic line with eighth notes. Dynamics include *mf* and *ff*. The left hand accompaniment continues.

44

Measures 44-47: The right hand plays a melodic line with eighth notes. Dynamics include *ppp* and *mf*. The left hand accompaniment continues.

48

Measures 48-51: The right hand plays a melodic line with eighth notes. Dynamics include *ppp* and *mf*. The left hand accompaniment continues.

Allegro D. C.

Example 9. Beethoven, *Piano Sonata Op. 7*, movement iii, Trio

a) Sketch

The image displays two systems of musical notation for a piano piece. The first system covers measures 1 through 16. The upper voice (treble clef) features a melodic line with a circled '9' above it, indicating a specific interval or note. Annotations include '3rd' with arrows pointing to intervals between notes, and '3rd' with arrows pointing to the overall melodic span. Chord progressions are labeled as I, IV 6, 6, and V 4. The lower voice (bass clef) provides harmonic support with chords and a dotted line labeled 'N' connecting notes. The second system covers measures 17 through 28. It features a circled '17' and a circled '25' above the upper voice. Annotations include '6th' with arrows pointing to intervals between notes, and '6th' with arrows pointing to the overall melodic span. Chord progressions are labeled as V 4 and V 4. The piece concludes with a double bar line and repeat dots.

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 1–4: The first melodic motion is on one level a neighbor, but has the effect of an interrupted passing motion, one that is completed in the following measures.
- Measures 1–16: The overall upper voice for these bars is a textbook example of boundary play, the boundary here being the stepwise connection of $\hat{3}$ to $\hat{2}$.
- Measures 17–28: The large scale sixth progression from $D\flat$ from $B\flat$ is echoed briefly by the more figural downward sixth in measures 27–8 (which also restores the major dominant).

The image shows a musical score for measures 29 to 43. The score is written for piano in a key with three flats (B-flat major or D-flat minor). The treble clef staff contains the melody, and the bass clef staff contains the accompaniment. Measure 29 is marked with a circled '29' and a '3' with an accent (^) above it. Measure 37 is marked with a circled '37'. An arrow labeled '3rd' points from measure 29 to measure 37. The final three measures (41-43) are marked with circled '3', '2', and '1' with accents (^) above them. The bass staff has harmonic analysis labels: 'I' under measure 29, 'IV 6' under measure 37, and 'V 6-5 / 4-3 / I' under measures 41-43. The text '+ coda' is written to the right of the score.

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 29–43: The retaking of the opening is actually an amalgam of the first phrase and the rhythmically compressed bars (measures 25–6; compare the sixteenth notes in the durational reduction) of the middle section; the displacement of these bars to the second beat plus the addition of the requisite final tonic fills out the expected hypermetric length.

b) Durational reduction

The image displays a musical score for piano, consisting of three systems of staves. The key signature is three flats (B-flat, E-flat, A-flat) and the time signature is 4/4. A tempo marking '♩ = ♩' is present at the beginning. The score includes dynamic markings such as *pp* ($\langle \rangle$ *ffp* and *ff*. Measure numbers 9, 17, 25, 29, and 37 are circled. The notation includes various note values, rests, and articulation marks like accents and slurs. The score concludes with a double bar line.

Example 10. Schubert, *Nähe des Geliebten* (second version)

Langsam, feierlich mit Anmuth. $\text{♩} = 50$.

Singstimme. $\frac{12}{8}$

Pianoforte. $\frac{12}{8}$

pp *cresc.* *f* *decresc.* *p*

Ich den - ke dein, wenn mir der
se - he dich, wenn auf dem

4

Son - ne Schimmer vom Mec - re strahlt; ich den - ke dein, — wenn
fer - nen We - ge der Staub - sich hebt; in tie - fer Nacht, — wenn

pp *ppp*

7

sich — des Mon. des Flimmer in Quel - len malt. Ich
auf — dem schmalen We. ge der Wan - drer bebt.

pp

Ich höre dich, wenn dort mit dumpfem Rauschen
Die Welle steigt!
Im stillen Hain, da geh' ich oft zu lauschen,
Wenn alles schweigt.

Ich bin bei dir; du seist auch noch so ferne,
Du bist mir nah!
Die Sonne sinkt, bald leuchten mir die Sterne.
O, wärest du da!

The Closeness of the Beloved (translation)

I think of you—when the sun's shimmers stream to me from the sea.

I think of you—when the moon's glimmers paint themselves on springs.

I hear you—when there waves well up with a dull roar!

—And in still groves, where often I go to listen, when all is silent.

I see you—when dust blows about on distant roads;

When, in the dark of night, on a narrow path, the wanderer quakes with fright.

I am with you; however distant you might be, you are near me!

The sun sinks, soon stars will shine. O, would that you were here!

Example 11. Schubert, *Nähe des Geliebten*, sketch

Contra-structural cover tones

The image displays a musical score for Schubert's 'Nähe des Geliebten' sketch. It consists of three staves: a vocal line at the top, a piano right-hand part in the middle, and a piano left-hand part at the bottom. The key signature is three flats (B-flat major or D-flat minor) and the time signature is 3/4. The vocal line features a melodic line with several phrases, some marked with arrows indicating direction. The piano accompaniment includes chords and moving lines, with some notes marked 'NN' (non-natural). Annotations include 'dim 4th?' above the first measure, '5th' above the second measure, and a series of numbers (4, 3, 2, 1) above the final measures. At the bottom, an 'Aux. cad.' section lists Roman numerals: III $\frac{5}{4}$, I $\frac{6}{b}$, II $\frac{6}{5}$, V $\frac{8}{4} \frac{7}{3}$, I, VI, IV, V $\frac{8}{4} \frac{7}{3}$, and I.

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 1–3: The diminished fourth traversed by the upper voice does not represent a genuine linear progression; the opening D^{\sharp} is an inner voice inflected to D^{\flat} when the G^{\flat} -major harmony appears. The bass B^{\flat} is retained through this inflection of the third coupled with a 5–6 exchange. Typically, this would represent a single prolonged harmony, but here the impression of E^{\flat} minor is initially so strong that it seems warranted to assign the first harmony its own *Stufe*.
- Measures 3–5: The isolation of the high G^{\flat} and the deliberate quality of the following downward motion justifies the choice of $\hat{5}$ as *Kopfton*. Nonetheless, the melody continually seeks to touch on the space of the upper fourth $\hat{5}$ to $\hat{8}$.
- Measures 6–7: The leap of the diminished fourth highlights the D^{\sharp} , but, unlike the piano introduction, this pitch comes from an already stated D^{\flat} , allowing Schubert to recreate the opening in a different context.
- Measures 9–10: The descending direction of the fourth, answered by the reversal in the left hand, suggests an empathetic response across registral distance (already prefigured in measure 6).

Example 12. Schumann, Loreley, Op. 53, no. 2

Nº 2. *Zart, leicht.*
Loreley.
(Wilhelmine Lorenz.)

Es flü - stern und rauschen die Wo - gen wohl ü - ber ihr stil - les

5 Haus. Es ruft eine Stimme: „Ge - den - ke mein! Bei stil - ler Nacht in

9 Voll - mondschein, ge - den - ke mein!“ Und flü - sternd zie - hen die

p *p* *ritard.* *ritard.* *pp* *p* *ritard.* *a tempo* *ritard.* *ritard.*

13

Wo - gen wohl ü - ber ihr stil - les Haus. „Ge - den - ke mein! ge -

17

den - ke mein! ge - den - ke mein!“

ritard.

pp

The waves whisper and rush around her empty house
A voice calls out, "Think of me!"

At the still of night, in full moonlight. "Think of me!"
And the whispering waves press against her empty house. "Think of me!"

Example 13. Schumann, *Loreley*, Op. 53, no. 2, sketch

A B

Contra-structural associations: * ^A 5 * ^B 5

(curtain) 1 2 3 4 (upbeat) 1 2 3 4

Aux. cad.: (#IV⁷) V I III (to V-I)

9 - 8
#7 - #7
#6 - #5
4 - 3

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 1–3: The auxiliary cadence involves three harmonies, but compressed to displace the #IV⁷ above the V. The effect is that of a suspended harmony, although the bass B in m. 1 is arguably an anticipation of its normative time span.
- Measures 2–5: The fifth progression in the upper voice is divided between two paired subphrases, in the manner of a free interruption. The double *Bassbrechung* becomes structural in the repetition in measures 11–5.
- Measure 6: This free-standing upbeat measure parallels the curtain in the first bar and effectively sets apart the quotation of spoken text within the poem.

A' B' * * *

(11)

(curtain) 1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4 (expansion)

(#IV7) V $\begin{matrix} 9 & - & - & 8 \\ \sharp 7 & - & - & \sharp 7 \\ \sharp 6 & - & - & \sharp 6 \\ 4 & - & - & 4 \end{matrix}$ I V $\begin{matrix} 9 & - & - & 8 \\ \sharp 7 & - & - & \sharp 7 \\ \sharp 6 & - & - & \sharp 6 \\ 4 & - & - & 4 \end{matrix}$ I

lower 5th div.

Supplementary notes:

- Measure 16: The omission of the upbeat measure makes the recall of the spoken text sounds more emphatic, in spite of the subdued dynamics.
- Measures 16–9: The upper voice divides into two parts, the contra-structural E reasserting its highpoint, the C \sharp resuming its structural role as neighbor to $\hat{5}$, reinforcing the effect of a voice distant from our present reality. The neighbor is supported by a plagal motion, identified here as a lower fifth divider, a term which Schenker abandoned but which may be relevant here.

Example 14. Brahms, *Meine Lieder*, Op. 106, no. 4

4. Meine Lieder

Adolf Frey

Bewegt und leise

Singstimme

Pianoforte

p dolce

5 Wenn mein Herz be - ginnt zu klin - gen und den

10 Tö - nen löst die Schwin - gen, *dolce*

15 schwe - ben vor mir her und wie - der

19 blei - che Won - nen, un - ver - ges - sen

23 und die Schat - ten von Cy - pres - sen.

28 Dun - kel klin - gen mei - ne Lie - der, dun - kel

33 klin - gen mei - ne Lie - der!

38 rit.

When my heart begins to sing and tones ring free,
 There hover back and forth before me blanced pleasures unforgotten,

And the shadows of cypress trees.
 My songs have a dark sound!

Example 15. Brahms, *Meine Lieder*, Op. 106, no. 4, sketch

The musical score consists of three staves: Voice, Treble Clef Piano, and Bass Clef Piano. The key signature is D major (two sharps). The time signature is 3/4. The piano accompaniment features a bass line with fingerings 1, 2, 3, 4 and chord symbols I, I, V (div.), III. The voice line has a circled '5' above measure 5 and a circled '13' above measure 13. A 'contra-structural motive' is indicated with a dashed line and arrow. A '*' above measure 5 is labeled '* = leaping passing tone.' The score ends with '(continues)'.

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 1–4: The structural voice-leading of the opening is essentially parallel tenths, masked by doublings and the implication of the bass. Ironically, the more definite texture appears with the arrival of the contra-structural motive in measure 4.
- Measure 5: The vocal E of measure 5 originates as a passing tone from an implied F \sharp ; leaping into this passing tone allows the contra-structural motive to take shape.
- Measures 9–12: The shape of the contra-structural motive more naturally belongs to C \sharp minor, toward which the music drives. The use of the Neapolitan in measure 11, however, allows Brahms to replicate the exact pitches of the original motive.
- Measures 13–7: The maintenance of D \sharp and B \sharp even as the music turns toward prolonging the relative major in measure 15 allows the continuation of the C \sharp minor version of the motive; this creates a linkage between phrases.

Supplementary notes:

- Measures 19–22: The low bass A, like the vocal A two octaves higher, is essentially an inner voice, as confirmed by the lower D in measure 22.
- Measures 23–7: The interpretation as a parenthesis is suggested by the voice-leading—one can jump from measure 22 to measure 28—and by the design—the half-note melody is an augmentation of the chromatic descent of measure 21.
- Measures 28–36: Compare the more complete 8-bar unit (with tonic cadence falling on the first bar of the next unit) with the more short-breathed 4-bar units of the opening (and the 8 bars left hanging in measures 15–22). This closing 8-bar unit also reinterprets the opening by placing it entirely within dominant harmony.