MTO 23.3 Examples: Blättler, A Voicing-Based Model for Additive Harmony

(Note: audio, video, and other interactive examples are only available online)
http://www.mtosmt.org/issues/mto.17.23.3/mto.17.23.3.blattler.php

Example 1. Reduction of the final cadence of Ravel, *L’enfant et les sortilèges*, R154–end
Example 2. Comparison of the impact of chord inversion upon an additive chord and upon a triad

(a) inversion of the penultimate chord of Example 1

(b) replacement of penultimate chord of Example 1 with a dominant triad

(c) inversion of the penultimate chord of Example 2b
**Example 3.** Potential alternate readings of the penultimate chord of *L'enfant et les sortilèges*; the pitch classes B, C, D, and E are shown with open noteheads, and omitted tones in the extended triad with filled-in noteheads.

**Example 4.** The relationship between a tonally plausible additive chord and a common-practice chord. In 4c, anchor-structure tones are shown as open noteheads and adorning tones as filled-in noteheads.
Example 5. Two-note anchor structures (t and e stand for ten and eleven)

Example 6. Ravel, *Ma mère l’Oye*, “Laideronette, impératrice des pagodes,” mm. 16–24; additive supertonic anchored by ro-interval 10
Example 7. Three-note anchor structures.
* – chords are voiced to avoid ro-interval 1 between the upper pitches.
** – chords have ro-interval 1 between the bass note and an upper pitch
Example 8. Examples of second-order anchor structures

The pitches of the anchor structure are set off in bold font and connected with brackets; this makes visually prominent how anchor structures serve as equivalence classes, partitioning the vast set of voicings into analytically productive categories of tonal plausibility.

(a) Ravel, *Le tombeau de Couperin*, “Rigaudon” mm. 1–8

(b) Milhaud, *Saudades Do Brasil*, “Tijuca,” mm. 5–9
Example 9. Inability of ro-interval 2 to support additive adornments

(a)  
ro-interval 2 as chord interval implies a seventh chord in second inversion

\[ \text{e.g. } , \text{ etc.} \]

(b)  
additive adornments of ro-interval 2, however, undermine that tonal plausibility:

adding ro-intervals 5, 6, 8, or 9 produces common-practice chords

adding ro-intervals 7, t, or e projects the bass as chord root

adding ro-interval 1 creates a cluster  adding ro-intervals 3 or 4 projects the bass as chord root
Example 10. Relative strength of anchor structures closer to the bass

Example 11. Poulenc, *Trois Pièces pour piano*, “Pastorale,” mm. 3–6; tonal plausibility changed by revoicing of inner parts

Example 12. Interaction between two-note and three-note anchor structures in a similar register

\begin{music}
\begin{musicnotes}
\begin{musicstandart}s
126
\end{musicstandart}
\begin{musicnotations}
\begin{musicnotations}
127
\end{musicnotations}
\end{musicnotations}
\end{musicnotes}
\end{music}
Example 14. Ravel, *Ma mere l'Oye*, “Pavane de la Belle au bois dormant,” mm. 5–8; two-note anchor-structure chord supporting *ro*-interval 1 as a minor ninth above the bass

Example 15a. Marked use of *ro*-interval 1 in Auric, Prélude from *L'Album des Six*; instances of *ro*-interval 1 are marked by boxes
Example 15b. Marked use of ro-interval 1 in Auric, Prélude from *L’Album des Six*; instances of ro-interval 1 are marked by boxes or lines.
### Example 16. Text and translation for Chabrier’s “Les Cigales”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Les Cigales</strong></th>
<th><strong>The Cicadas</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rosemonde Gérard (w/ edits by Chabrier)</td>
<td>translation by Graham Johnson &amp; Richard Stokes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le soleil est droit sur la sente, l'ombre bleut sous les figuiers, ces cris au loin multipliés, c'est midi, c'est midi qui chante!</td>
<td>The sun’s overhead the path, The shadow turns blue beneath the figs, These distant chirpings multiply, It is noon, it is noon that sings!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sous l'astre qui conduit le chœur, les chanteuses dissimulées jettent leurs raquées ululées de quel infatigable cœur!</td>
<td>Beneath the sun that conducts the choir, The hidden songsters Utter their raucous cries From what unflagging hearts!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Les cigales, ces bestioles, ont plus d'âme que les violes, les cigales, les cigalons, chantent mieux que les violons!</td>
<td>The cicadas, these tiny beasts, Have more soul than viols, Cicadas, tiny cicadas, Sing better than violins!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S'en donnent elles, les cigales, sur les tas de poussière gris, sous les oliviers rabougris étoilés de fleurettes pâles.</td>
<td>They revel in it, the cicadas, On the heaps of grey dust, Beneath the stunted olive-trees Studded with little pale flowers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Et grises de chanter ainsi, Elles font leur musique folle; Et toujours leur chanson s’envole Des touffes du gazon roussi!</td>
<td>And drunk from such singing, They make their mad music And their song soars unceasingly From the tufts of russet grass.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Les cigales, ces bestioles, ont plus d'âme que les violes, les cigales, les cigalons, chantent mieux que les violons!</td>
<td>The cicadas, these tiny beasts, Have more soul than viols, Cicadas, tiny cicadas, Sing better than violins!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aux rustres épars dans le chaume, le grand astre torrentiel, a larges flots, du haut du ciel, verse le sommeil et son baume.</td>
<td>On the rustics across the stubble, The great torrential sun From high in heaven Pours its sleep and balm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tout est mort, rien ne bruit plus qu'elles toujours, les forcéennes, entre les notes égrenées de quelque lointain Angélus!</td>
<td>All is dead, no sound but theirs Frenzied and insistent, Among the far-flung notes From some distant angelus!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Les cigales, ces bestioles, ont plus d'âme que les violes, les cigales, les cigalons, chantent mieux que les violons!</td>
<td>The cicadas, these tiny beasts, Have more soul than viols, Cicadas, tiny cicadas, Sing better than violins!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example 17. Chabrier’s “Les Cigales,” mm. 1–35; the beginnings of chains of repeated *ro*-interval-1 chords are marked with arrows.
Example 17 (continued)

chanté! Sous l'as - tre qui con - duit le choeur, Les chan - teu - ses dis - si - mu - nu


couer! Les ci - ga - les, ces best-i - o - les, Ont plus d'â - me que les vi - o - les,

Les ci - ga - les, les ci-ga-lons, Chan-ten - mieux que les vi - o -
Example 18. Scarcity of adornment options for three-note anchor structures

- pitches that could produce competing plausibilities: D, F, F#
- pitches that would produce ro-interval 1: G#, B, C#
- pitches that would merely complete a common-practice chord: E, Eb

Example 19. Satie, Préludes Flasques, iv, mm. 1–8; three-note anchor structures
Example 20. Whole-step adjacencies in final tonic chords in the Parisian modernist repertoire
(a) reduction of Debussy, *La mer*, ii, R40–41
Example 20. Whole-step adjacencies in final tonic chords in the Parisian modernist repertoire
(b) Debussy, *Estampes*, “Pagodes,” mm. 93–98
Example 20. Whole-step adjacencies in final tonic chords in the Parisian modernist repertoire
(c) Chabrier, “Les Cigales,” mm. 93–98


Très modéré

quitter; en
laissant vibrer
Example 22. The potential for chords to fulfill the same tonal function despite divergent pitch-class and scale-degree content
(a) reduction of Stravinsky, Firebird, R206–208
Example 22. The potential for chords to fulfill the same tonal function despite divergent pitch-class and scale-degree content
(b) reduction of Delius, Sea Drift, mm. 1–9

Example 22. The potential for chords to fulfill the same tonal function despite divergent pitch-class and scale-degree content
(c) reduction of Ravel, Introduction et allegro, R28
Example 22. The potential for chords to fulfill the same tonal function despite divergent pitch-class and scale-degree content (d) transposition of the highlighted chords from (a)–(c) into the same key, so as to compare anchor structures and pitch content

![Example 22](image)

Example 23. Different tonal plausibilities arising from distinct voicings of a single pitch-class/scale-degree collection

![Example 23](image)
Example 24. Ravel, *Valses nobles et sentimentales*, i; pitch-class set \{G, A, B, D, E\} voiced so as to have different tonal functions

(a) mm. 1–2; set voiced as tonic in G major

Modéré - très franc \( \frac{\text{j}}{\text{=} 176} \)

![Musical notation for mm. 1–2]

\[ \text{G: V I} \]

pitch-class set \{G, A, B, D, E\}

(b) mm. 11–20; set voiced as dominant in D major

![Musical notation for mm. 11–20]

\[ \text{D: V/V} \]

pitch-class set \{G, A, B, D, E\}
Example 25. Dissonant passage tonally grounded by anchor structures
(a) Ravel, *Le tombeau de Couperin*, “Forlane,” mm. 1–9

Example 25. Dissonant passage tonally grounded by anchor structures
(b) reduction of mm. 1–5 from (a); anchor structures shown in open noteheads
Example 26. Piston’s guidelines for voicing a ninth chord

Example 27. Flexibility of the third in two-note anchor-structure chords
(a) chromatically altered third in Satie’s Gymnopedie No. 1, mm. 36–39

Example 27. Flexibility of the third in two-note anchor-structure chords
(b) omitted chordal third in Debussy’s “a fille aux cheveux de lin,” mm. 18–19
Example 28. Comparison of Hull’s analysis and anchor-structure analysis of Butterworth, *A Shropshire Lad*, mm. 54–56

**Hull's analysis:** V (3rd inv) –– 7

**anchor-structure analysis:** IV V I

Example 29. Ravel, *Valses nobles et sentimentales*, mm. 56–61; verticalities interpreted as the coincidence of a chord background and non-essential dissonance are marked with arrows

Example 30. Debussy, “La Puerta del Vino,” mm. 5–12; viable additive chords interpreted as chords with nonessential dissonance
Example 31. Reduction of Poulenc, Les biches, “Rag Mazurka,” R89; suspension of a major tenth above the bass
Example 32. Epigraph to “Les entretiens de la Belle et de la Bête”

Epigraph to “Les entretiens de la Belle et de la Bête.”
(Ravel, adapted from Jeanne-Marie Leprince de Beaumont)

—“Quand je pense à votre bon cœur, vous ne me paraissez pas si laid.”—“Oh! dame oui! j’ai le coeur bon, mais je suis un monstre.”—“Il y a bien des hommes qui sont plus monstres que vous.”—Si j’avais de l’esprit, je vous ferais un grand compliment pour vous remercier, mais je ne suis qu’une bête. …

La Belle, voulez-vous être ma femme?”—“Non, la Bête! …”

—“Je meurs content puisque j’ai le plaisir de vous revoir encore une fois.”—“Non, ma chère Bête, vous ne mourrez pas: vous vivrez pour devenir mon époux!” … La Bête avait disparu et elle ne vit plus à ses pieds qu’un prince plus beau que l’Amour qui la remerciait d’avoir fini son enchantement.

English translation by author

“When I think of your good heart, you do not appear so ugly to me.”—“Oh! yes, my lady, I have a good heart, but I am a monster.”—“There are plenty of men who are more monstrous than you.”—“If I had the wit, I would pay you a great compliment to thank you, but I am nothing but a beast.”

“Beauty, would you be my wife?”—“No, Beast! …”

“I die content because I have had the pleasure of seeing you once again.”—“No, my dear Beast, you will not die: you will live to become my husband!” … The Beast had disappeared and she saw at her feet only a prince more handsome than Love who thanked her for having broken his spell.
Example 33. Use of anchor structures to resolve the relationship between Beauty and the Beast in Ravel, “Les entretiens de la Belle et de la Bête” (a) Beauty’s theme; weakly anchored F-Lydian melody followed by |10|-anchored circle of fifths

Mouvt de Valse très modéré  

F Lydian

Circle-of-fifths of |t|-anchored chords

F Lydian reasserted

WT chord  
(& tritone substitution)

WT chord  
(& tritone substitution)
Example 33. Use of anchor structures to resolve the relationship between Beauty and the Beast in Ravel, “Les entretiens de la Belle et de la Bête” (b) Beast’s theme; use of symmetric scales and eschewal of tonal plausibilities

WT1

OCT1,2

49

56

56

WT subset of OCT1,2

OCT0,1 (w/ G# appoggiaturas)

63

WT subset of OCT 0,1

tonal plausibility ([f] / E) unrealized

tonal plausibility ([f] / F#) unrealized
Example 33. Use of anchor structures to resolve the relationship between Beauty and the Beast in Ravel, “Les entretiens de la Belle et de la Bête” (c) failed union of Beauty and the Beast; |10|-anchored chords indicated with arrows

F major undercut by chromatic bass notes
Example 33. Use of anchor structures to resolve the relationship between Beauty and the Beast in Ravel, “Les entretiens de la Belle et de la Bête” (d) anchor structures tonally resolve the Beast’s melody and symmetrical scales.
Example 34. Poulenc, *Trois pièces pour piano*, Pastorale, mm. 1–2

Calme et mystérieux  \( \text{\textit{\textbf{\( \frac{3}{4} \)}}} \) = 72
Example 35a. Exploration of the tonal potential of the opening chord in Poulenc, *Trois pièces pour piano*, Pastorale (a) opening section casts C-rooted offspring of the chord as ii\(^{07}\) in B\(^{b}\) and iii\(^{07}\) in A\(^{b}\).
Example 35b. Exploration of the tonal potential of the opening chord in Poulenc, *Trois pièces pour piano*, Pastorale  (b) middle section casts C-rooted chords as vii$^6_7$ in D♭, V7 in F minor, and I in C.

---

C-rooted chord as vii$^6_7$

---

C-rooted chord as V$^7$

---

C-rooted chord as I
Example 35c. Exploration of the tonal potential of the opening chord in Poulenc, *Trois pièces pour piano*, Pastorale (c) final section emphasizes the ambiguous and unresolved nature of the chord.

WT version of the opening chord