

MTO 18.4 Examples: Wadsworth, Directional Tonality in Schumann's Early Works

(Note: audio, video, and other interactive examples are only available online)

<http://www.mtosmt.org/issues/mto.12.18.4/mto.12.18.4.wadsworth.php>

Example 1. Marked modulation from D minor to F major in Schumann's Intermezzo op. 4, no. 5

The musical score is presented in two systems. The first system, starting at measure 29, shows a piano introduction with a forte (ff) dynamic. The key signature is D minor (two flats). The harmonic structure is indicated by Roman numerals: *d* (D minor), *i* (D minor), and (V/III) (F major triad). The second system, starting at measure 34, shows a first ending (1.) and a second ending (2.). The key signature changes to F major (one flat). The harmonic structure is indicated by Roman numerals: (III) (D minor triad), V (D minor), F (F major), and (V/III) (D minor triad).

Example 2. Continuum of directional-tonal states between sectional/continuous extremes

Surface Cues	Typical Forms Starting in C major (keys in bold are structural)	Narratives
1. Abrupt (sectional): sudden modulation and thematic contrast	<u>Sections:</u> A ----- B----- <u>Keys:</u> CM ---- am -----	Static contrast between mental states
2. Hybrid : sudden thematic contrasts; one or more alternations between keys	<u>Sections:</u> A---- B----- A----- <u>Keys:</u> CM ---am--- CM-am	Both #1 and #3; topical transformation of the same key possible
3. Overlapped (continuous): thematic material is homogenous; paired keys alternate one or more times	<u>Sections:</u> A----B (A')--A----- <u>Keys:</u> CM ---am--- CM-am	Dramatic conflict between key centers

Example 3. Instances of Directional-Tonal and Tonal-Pairing Structures

a. Directional-Tonal

C Common Tone

E Common Tone

C: I vi
a: III i

C: I vi
a: III i

Example 3. Instances of Directional-Tonal and Tonal-Pairing Structures

b. Tonal-Pairing

Common Descent

a: III ————— i V i

c: I V vi —————

Example 4. Continuum of dual tonality (DT) and monotony (MT)

#1	#2	#3	#4	#5
DT Primary	DT/MT Equal or Slightly favoring MT	MT Primary	MT except Design	MT in Harmony + Design
DT			MT	

Example 5a. Schumann's directional-tonal works in opp. 1–23 and 26

a. "Abrupt" directional-tonal works

Work	Paired Keys	Position of Work on DT/MT Continuum	Reasons why Abrupt Directional-Tonal
1. Op. 2, no. 7	F → A ^b (minor 3rd)	#2: DT: 2 (number of sections in each key, cadence vs. pedal point) MT in A ^b : 3 (key durations, marked resolutions, major mode)	Two formal sections (measures 1–8 and 9–24) having contrasting keys and rhythmic motives, registral disjunction between sections
2. Op. 6, no. 16	G → b (major 3rd)	#2: DT: 2 (number of sections in each key, major mode first section) MT/b: 2 (pairing interval of M3, cadence in b)	Scherzo and trio (same movement), thematic contrast, texture change, contrasting keys, registral disjunction between sections
3. Op. 16, no. 7	c → E ^b (minor 3rd)	#2: DT: 2 (number of sections in each key, major mode in short section) MT/c: 2 (key durations, cadence to root position i)	Textural and thematic contrast between ternary form (measures 1–188) to interlude (measures 189–216); ternary is in C minor, the interlude in E ^b
4. Op. 21, no. 8	F [#] → D (major 3rd)	#1: DT: 2 (original thematic material vs. ending key; Trio I in V/ [#] vs. return of D) MT/D: 1 (marked resolutions)	Trio I (measures 49–93) follows an <i>agitato</i> movement, but Trio II (measures 129–227) is not; Trio II is extended in length with a tonic pedal point (measures 255–279); the mvt. ends at the fermata after a 3-bar Adagio (measures 279–81)

Example 5b. Schumann's directional-tonal works in opp. 1–23 and 26
b. “Hybrid” and “Overlapped” directional-tonal works

Work	Number of sections in which each key is present	Position of Work on Abrupt/Overlapped continuum	Position of Work on DT/MT continuum	Degree of opposition between keys
1. Op. 2, no. 4	A: 3/3 #̣: 3/3	Hybrid (contrasting B section)	#3: DT: 1 (number of sections in each key) MT/#̣: 3 (PAC, //, no complete A major tonic triad)	Contextual (registral peaks in #̣)
2. Op. 4, no. 5	F: 2/3 d: 2/3	Hybrid (contrasting B sections)	#1: DT: 2 (F main theme/d cadences; key of trio/d number of sections in each key) MT/F or d: 0	Stylistic (pastoral/ <i>Sturm und Drang</i>)
3. Op. 5, no. 6	a: 3/3 C: 2/3 (ends work)	Overlapped (one topic)	#3: DT: 1 (no PAC/a vs. repetition of cadence in C) MT/a: 3 (theme in a, //, pedal in a)	None
4. Op. 6, no. 11	b: 2/3 D: 3/3 (ends work)	Overlapped (one topic)	#2: DT: 1 (thematic homogeneity/cadence in D) MT/D: 2 (number of formal sections, cadences in D)	None
5. Op. 9, “Florestan-Coquette” (measures 1–3)	g: 3/3 Ḅ: 3/3	Overlapped (Sphinx motive)	#1: DT: 3 (number of sections in each key; g frame vs. Ḅ PAC; Ḅ pedal vs. new Coquette material) MT/g or Ḅ: 0	Stylistic (<i>Sturm und Drang/ waltz</i>)
6. Op. 9, “Replique”	Ḅ: 1/1 g: 1/1	Overlapped (one topic)	#3: DT: 1 (PACs in both keys) MT/Ḅ: 3 (duration of Ḅ key, modulation to d or iii/Ḅ, Ḅ associated with theme)	None
7. Op. 9, “Aveu”	f: 3/3 Ạ: 3/3	Overlapped (one topic)	#3: DT: 1 (no PAC/f vs. repetition of Ạ PAC) MT/f: 3 (B section is in Ạ major, // in f, main theme is in f)	Contextual (register)
8. Op. 13, Var. 4	♯: 3/3 E: 2/3 (ends work)	Overlapped (one topic)	#3: DT: 1 (no PAC/♯ vs. repetition of PAC/E) MT/♯: 3 (duration of keys, // in ♯, main theme in ♯)	None
9. Op. 15, no. 11	e: 7/7 G: 5/7 (ends work)	Hybrid (contrasting B and C sections)	#1: DT: 2 (duration of G key vs. main theme in e; G PAC vs. // in e) MT/G: 1 (initial e tonality is less than phrase length)	Stylistic (lyrical/toccata)
10. Op. 16, no. 4	Ḅ: 3/3 g: 3/3	Hybrid (contrasting B section)	#2: DT: 1 (authentic cadence in Ḅ vs. // in g) MT/Ḅ: 2 (duration of keys; main theme in Ḅ)	None
11. Op. 21, no. 3	b: 3/3 D: 3/3	Hybrid (contrasting Intermezzo)	#1: DT: 2 (number of sections in each key; short duration of b opening vs. // in b) MT/D: 1 (3rd-related keys to D)	None

Example 6. Analysis of a #1 blending: “Florestan” from op. 9 (Carnaval)

a. Problematic end of “Florestan” movement

The image shows a musical score for the end of the 'Florestan' movement and the beginning of the 'Coquette' movement. The score is in G minor, 2/4 time, and consists of two staves: a treble staff and a bass staff. The first section, labeled 'Florestan end', starts at measure 55 and ends at measure 60. It features a piano (*f*) dynamic and a key signature of one flat. The second section, labeled 'Coquette beginning', starts at measure 61 and ends at measure 66. It features a piano (*pp*) dynamic and a key signature of two flats. A vertical arrow labeled 'movement boundary' points to the first measure of the 'Coquette beginning' section. Below the bass staff, the chord 'g: V⁹₇' is written under the first measure of the 'Florestan end' section, and 'B^b: I' is written under the first measure of the 'Coquette beginning' section.

Example 6. Analysis of a #1 blending: “Florestan” from op. 9 (Carnaval)

b. Fragile monotonal structure in G minor

The image shows a musical score for the 'A section', 'B section', 'Retransition', and 'A'' sections of 'Florestan' in op. 9 (Carnaval). The score is in G minor, 2/4 time, and consists of two staves: a treble staff and a bass staff. The 'A section' is marked with a 5 above the staff and includes measures 2, 5, 7, 15, 17, 21, 22, and 27. The 'B section' is marked with a 5 above the staff and includes measures 30, 37, 42, and 45. The 'Retransition' is marked with a 6 above the staff and includes measure 37. The 'A'' section is marked with a 5 above the staff and includes measure 45. Below the bass staff, the chord 'g: i' is written under measure 2, 'III' is written under measure 30, 'vi/III? i?' is written under measure 37, 'iv' is written under measure 42, and 'V' is written under measure 45. A vertical arrow points to the first measure of the 'Retransition' section.

Example 6. Analysis of a #1 blending: “Florestan” from op. 9 (Carnaval)
 c. Directional-tonal move from G minor to B \flat major (tonal pairing view)

The image displays two systems of musical notation for the piece "Florestan". The top system is labeled "g:" and the bottom system is labeled "B \flat :". Both systems show a piano accompaniment with treble and bass staves. Above the treble staff, fingerings (5, 6, 5, 6, 5) and breath marks (A, B, A' "Coquette") are indicated. Below the bass staff, chord symbols and Roman numerals are provided: *i*, (III), (iv), (V), III, and "Coquette" with $\hat{2}$ $\hat{1}$. Measure numbers (2, 5, 7, 11, 15, 17, 21, 27, 30, 37, 42, 45, 1, 3) are placed between the staves. Dashed lines connect notes between the two systems, illustrating the tonal pairing and the directional move from G minor to B \flat major.

Example 6. Analysis of a #1 blending: “Florestan” from op. 9 (Carnaval)
 d. Topical events at the surface of “Florestan”

The image shows two systems of musical notation for "Florestan", focusing on topical events. The top system is labeled "A section beginning" and "Papillons quote". It includes markings for "Passionato.", "sf", "etc.", and "Adagio.". The bottom system is labeled "B section start" and includes a "p" marking. Chord symbols and Roman numerals are provided below the bass staff: *g*: V 9_7 , B \flat : V 1 , vii 7 /vi?, B \flat : V 7 , I, ($\frac{6}{4}$), I. Measure numbers 1, 9, 29, and 3 are indicated. The notation shows the progression of chords and the change in tempo and dynamics between sections.

Example 7. Analysis of a #2 blending (op. 2, no. 7)

a. Directional-tonal reading from F minor to A \flat major

A section
 C common tone ($\hat{5}/f$)
 f consonant support (i)
 (to m. 9)
 F: vii $^{\circ}4_3/V$
 A \flat : CT $^{\circ}7$

B section
 C common tone ($\hat{3}/A^{\flat}$)
 A \flat consonant support (I)
 A \flat : ii 6_5 V 6_4 $\frac{5}{3}$ I ii 6_5 V 6_4 $\frac{5}{3}$ I

Example 7. Analysis of a #2 blending (op. 2, no. 7)

b. Monotonal view in A \flat

Introduction
 A \flat : vi (to m. 11)

Primary tone (in A \flat)
 (from m. 5) $\hat{5}$ $\hat{5}$ $\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$ $\hat{2}$ // $\hat{5}$ $\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$ $\hat{2}$ $\hat{1}$
 a phrase a' phrase
 A \flat : I ii 6_5 V 6_4 $\frac{5}{3}$ I ii 6_5 V 6_4 $\frac{5}{3}$ I

Example 7. Analysis of a #2 blending (op. 2, no. 7)

c. Surface events in op. 2, no. 7

Example 8. An analysis of a #3 blending: "Aveu," op. 9 (Carnaval)

a. F-minor graph of tonal pairing

Example 8. An analysis of a #3 blending: "Aveu," op. 9 (Carnaval)

b. A♭-major graph of tonal pairing

Example 8. An analysis of a #3 blending: "Aveu," op. 9 (Carnaval)

c. Directional-tonal view of "Aveu."

common tone ($\hat{5}/f$) \longrightarrow ($\hat{3}/A^b$)

1 3 8 9 11 12

f: i III V A^b : i vi V $\begin{matrix} 6 & 5 \\ 4 & 3 \end{matrix}$ I

Example 8. An analysis of a #3 blending: "Aveu," op. 9 (Carnaval)

d. Topical events at surface

Passionato.
"Pianto"

1 5

high register

A B

i/f sf sf

bass delay
III/f

high register

7 9

A'

vii^7/G V/C V^7/f i/f or $vi/A^b?$

sf sf

bass delay
III/f or $I/A^b?$

Example 9. Dual-tonal/monotonal play in "Coquette" and "Replique" (op. 9)

a. "Coquette"Replique:" directional-tonal structure

B^b: I ————— (iii) V⁶⁻⁴

vii ⁷ /vi	vi
g: vii ⁷	i

 V i

Example 9. Dual-tonal/monotonal play in "Coquette" and "Replique" (op. 9)

b. Surface events in "Replique"

B^b: I g: V⁶⁻⁷/₄₋₅ i

Example 9. Dual-tonal/monotonal play in "Coquette" and "Replique" (op. 9)

c. "Florestan"Replique:" a problematic, large monotonal structure in G minor

g: i (III) (v) (vii⁷) i iv V i